



Erasmus+

Cooperation for innovation and the exchange of good practices sub-programme

TECHNICAL REPORT form

Programme	Erasmus+
Sub-Programme	Cooperation for innovation and the exchange of good practices
Action	Capacity Building in higher education
Sub-Action	Structural Projects
Call for Proposal	EAC-A04-2015
Project number	574273-EPP-1-2016-1-AM-EPPKA2-CBHE-SP
Agreement/decision number	20163801
Project Title	Promoting internationalization of research through establishment of Cycle 3 QA System in line with the European Agenda
Language used to complete the form	English

Contractual Data

Dates and Beneficiaries

Dates

Project Start: 15/10/2016	Project End: 14/10/2019
Activities Start:	Activities End:
Project Duration(months): 36	

Beneficiary Data

Role	PIC	Name	Country
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	967202327	MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE	Kazakhstan
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	933221675	INDEPENDENT KAZAKH AGENCY FOR QUALITY ASSURANCE IN EDUCATION (IQAA)	Kazakhstan
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	941168594	M AUEZOV SOUTH KAZAKHSTAN STATE UNIVERSITY	Kazakhstan
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	935151296	JOINT STOCK COMPANY KAZGUU UNIVERSITY	Kazakhstan
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	916268306	MINISTRY OF EDUCATION, CULTURE, SCIENCE & SPORTS	Mongolia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	921210650	MONGOLIAN NATIONAL COUNCIL FOR EDUCATION ACCREDITATION	Mongolia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	921209874	OTGONTENGER UNIVERSITY	Mongolia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	925609309	NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MONGOLIA	Mongolia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	999835746	UNIVERSIDAD DE ALCALA	Spain
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	934017366	HAUT CONSEIL DE L'EVALUATION DE LA RECHERCHE ET DE L'ENSEIGNEMENT SUPERIEUR	France
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	916450860	UNIVERSITE CLERMONT AUVERGNE	France
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	986217625	UNIVERSITE JEAN MOULIN LYON III	France
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	998781162	UNIWERSYTET JANA KOCHANOWSKIEGO W KIELCACH	Poland
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	934119022	MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF THE REPUBLIC OF ARMENIA/ HAYASTANI HANRAPETUTYAN KRTUTYAN EV GITUTYAN NAKHARARUTYUN	Armenia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	933664771	NATIONAL CENTER FOR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE FOUNDATION	Armenia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	998298975	YEREVAN STATE UNIVERSITY	Armenia

Co-Beneficiary / Partner	911025650	STATE ACADEMY OF FINE ARTS OF ARMENIA FOUNDATION	Armenia
Coordinating Organization / Beneficiary	929396383	UNIVERSITE FRANCAISE EN ARMENIE FONDATION	Armenia
Management Contact Person	929396383	UNIVERSITE FRANCAISE EN ARMENIE FONDATION	Armenia
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	938113773	MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF UKRAINE	Ukraine
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	941523323	SIMON KUZNETS KHARKIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS	Ukraine
Co-Beneficiary / Partner	939287473	KYIV NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF TRADE AND ECONOMICS	Ukraine

Legal Representative

Organisation Legal Address

Name: UNIVERSITE FRANCAISE EN ARMENIE FONDATION	
Street: RUE DAVID ANHAGTH 10 BATIMENT 1	
Post Code: 0037	City: YEREVAN
Country: Armenia	

Department

Name:	
Street: 10, David Anhagth St., building 1	
Post Code: 0037	City: Yerevan
Country: Armenia	
Local Address:	
Internet site: www.ufar.am	

Contact

Title: Prof.	Function: Rector
Name Lavest	Last Name: Jean-Marc
Phone Number 1: 00 374 10 28 97 50	Phone Number 2:
Fax Number:	Mobile Number:
Email: recteur@ufar.am	

Contact Person

Organisation Legal Address

Name: UNIVERSITE FRANCAISE EN ARMENIE FONDATION

Street: RUE DAVID ANHAGTH 10 BATIMENT 1

Post Code: 0037

City: YEREVAN

Country: Armenia

Department

Name:

Street: 10, David Anhagth St., building 1

Post Code: 0037

City: Yerevan

Country: Armenia

Local Address:

Internet site: www.ufar.am

Contact

Title: Dr.

Function: Vice - Rector

Name: Arayik

Last Name: Navoyan

Phone Number 1: 00 374 10 24 96 48

Phone Number 2: 00 374 55 10 06 66

Fax Number: 00 374 10 24 96 45

Mobile Number:

Email: vice_recteur@ufar.am

Project Summary and Horizontal Issues

Project Description

English - 1	<p>C3QA (Promoting internationalization of research through establishment and operationalization of Cycle 3 Quality Assurance System in line with the European Integration Agenda) is a three-year cross-regional and multi-partner structural project under EAC/A04/2015 call and Key Action 2 - Capacity Building in the Field of Higher Education. Its wider objective is to contribute to the establishment of a knowledge-based society in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Ukraine, and Mongolia through the launch and operationalization of a robust quality assurance system for internationalization of Cycle 3 programs.</p> <p>The specific objectives are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- To develop/update national policy frameworks for cycle 3 programs in line with the European integration agenda;- To build on the capacity of the systems to efficiently operationalize the internal and external quality assurance systems for Cycle 3 programs;- To establish an external and internal quality assurance systems to promote quality of Cycle 3 programs;- To promote internationalization of Cycle 3 programs with joint efforts of the key stakeholders and cross-regional cooperation. <p>The principle outcomes and outputs are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">- National policy frameworks on EQA of Cycle 3 programs adopted in the partner countries;- External and internal quality assurance systems for Cycle 3 programs implemented in line with European integration agenda;- Cycle 3 programs accredited by respective EQA bodies;- Cycle 3 programs contribute to the development of knowledge-based society;- The results of Cycle 3 programs are aligned with international best practice and contribute to research internationalization;- Cross-regional cooperation leads to convergence in line with European developments. <p>The cross-regional nature of the project ensures learning from existing practices, successful experience exchange, long-standing cooperation between the 4 partner country and EU partners – with a major aim of promoting voluntary convergence with EU developments.</p>
-------------	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Horizontal Issues

Previous recommendations/follow-up

The project EMT and consortium implemented the following concrete actions in line with the recommendations of NEOs monitoring visits:

- National dissemination events are foreseen in all PCs to present the intermediate results of the project to all the stakeholders. Dissemination events will be organized in 2 stages. For the 1st stage the propositions for improvement of regulatory framework of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes organization will be done in May-June in order to incorporate the stakeholders' views for the legal documents to be presented to the Ministries approval for improvement of the Cycle 3 programmes delivery. For the 2nd stage the presentation of the elaborated standards and guidelines of quality assurance of doctoral programs accreditation will be implemented as an intermediate activity before the pilot accreditation,
- In project partner institutions the internal discussion were organized, involving the relevant stakeholders, such as:
<http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/articles/profile/2462>
<http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/articles/profile/2601>
<https://www.facebook.com/100009955218078/videos/609147692760399/?id=100009955218078>
https://www.facebook.com/permalink.php?story_fbid=602773440064491&id=100009955218078
- The active involvement of the Ministries of Education is highly encouraged within the consortium. The project coordinator will use these national discussions as well as annual monitoring visits to keep the Ministries active. These discussions meetings will be held in headship of Ministries. In national events special attention will be given to the participation of the PhD students and to assure visibility.
- Project partner institutions webpages contain relevant information on the project outcomes and activities as well as links to the project website, which is used as management and visibility tool: www.c3-qa.com
- The project Quality Assurance Plan and Dissemination Strategy are agreed and used,
- The purchase of equipment is finalized for all partners. The EMT with Mongolian and Kazak partners is working on reimbursement issues of VAT paid by Mongolian and Kazak universities.
- In Ukraine, in order to ensure inter-project coaching and synergy of projects, inter-project coaching and cooperation of Erasmus+ CBHE DOCHUB was maintained by the meeting in Vilnius 22-23 June 2017, Tampere - 14-15, December 2017,
- In order to ensure efficient involvement of Ministry representation the Kazakh Ministry of Education and Science supports, promotes and adopts the quality assurance framework for Cycle 3 programmes providers in Kazakhstan. The Ministry also participated in writing a country report, provided statistical data and regulatory documents and the representatives of MES provided personal data and e-mails of PhD students for sociological survey to develop recommendations on enhancement of doctoral programmes,
- In order to explore internationalization aspects, IQAA has developed new standards and guidelines for doctoral programmes accreditation in line with ESG standards and Salzburg principles as part of the C3QA project,
- In order to pay attention to the accreditation of doctoral programmes to avoid duplication of the results, IQAA ensures that the newly developed standards do not duplicate the previous standards applied within the programme accreditation by IQAA. To make sure you can visit our site at <https://iqaa.kz/en/>
- In order to ensure Quality assurance and sustainability strategy, IQAA will conduct a pilot accreditation of two doctoral study programs of the partner- universities (KazGUU and M. Auezov SKSU) so that at the final stage of the project real planned results are obtained,
- A monitoring visit to Mongolia is foreseen on May 3-4 by the grant coordinator.

Transversal issues

N/A

Involvement of people with fewer opportunities

Award Criteria

Typology

Horizontal priorities

Fostering the assessment of transversal skills	<input type="checkbox"/>
Promoting the take-up of practical entrepreneurial experiences in education, training and youth work	<input type="checkbox"/>
Promoting the professional development of staff and youth workers in ICT methodologies	<input type="checkbox"/>
Supporting the production and adoption of Open Educational Resources in diverse European languages	<input type="checkbox"/>
Facilitating the validation of non-formal and informal learning and its permeability with formal education pathways	<input type="checkbox"/>

Linkages

School education	<input type="checkbox"/>
Higher education	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Adult education	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational training	<input type="checkbox"/>
Youth sector	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cross-sector	<input type="checkbox"/>

If cross sector is selected

School education	<input type="checkbox"/>
Higher education	<input type="checkbox"/>
Adult education	<input type="checkbox"/>
Vocational training	<input type="checkbox"/>
Youth sector	<input type="checkbox"/>

CBHE Aims

Promote voluntary convergence with EU developments in higher education.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Promote people to people contacts, intercultural awareness and understanding.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Contribute to the cooperation between the EU and the eligible Partner Countries (and amongst the eligible Partner Countries).	<input type="checkbox"/>
Support eligible Partner Countries to address the challenges facing their higher education institutions and systems, including those of quality, relevance, equity of access, planning, delivery, management, governance.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Support the modernisation, accessibility and internationalisation of the higher education field in the eligible Partner Countries.	<input type="checkbox"/>

CBHE Objectives

Improve the quality of higher education and enhance its relevance for the labour market and society.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Improve the level of competences and skills in HEIs by developing new and innovative education programmes.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Enhance the management, governance and innovation capacities, as well as the internationalisation of HEIs.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Increase the capacities of national authorities to modernise their higher education systems, by supporting to the definition, implementation and monitoring of reform policies.	<input type="checkbox"/>
Foster regional integration and cooperation across different regions of the world through joint initiatives, sharing of good practices and cooperation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Specific activities

Modernisation of policies, governance and management of higher education systems	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Strengthening of relations between higher education systems and the wider economic and social environment	<input type="checkbox"/>

Regions involved

Region 1 - Western Balkans	<input type="checkbox"/>
Region 2 - Eastern Partnership Countries	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Region 3 - South Mediterranean Countries	<input type="checkbox"/>

Region 4 - Russian Federation	<input type="checkbox"/>
Region 6 - Asia	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Region 7 - Central Asia	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Region 8 - Latin America	<input type="checkbox"/>
Region 9 – Iran, Iraq, Yemen	<input type="checkbox"/>
Region 10 - South Africa	<input type="checkbox"/>
Region 11 - ACP	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cross-regional	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Regional	<input type="checkbox"/>
National	<input type="checkbox"/>

Special mobility strand

The project contains a Special Mobility Strand	<input type="checkbox"/>
The project does not contains a Special Mobility Strand	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

Involvement of people with fewer opportunities

YES/NO	<input type="checkbox"/>
--------	--------------------------

Assessment Criteria

Relevance of the project

Relevance to the objectives

The C3QA project is still relevant for the national context in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine as in all these countries the reforms of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes are ongoing. In Armenia, the new law on higher education (in discussion in the National Assembly) is foreseen for the introduction of professional PhD studies and the Armenian Ministry of Education and Sciences is highly interested in the project outcomes in order to update the existing regulatory framework of organization and delivery of Cycle 3 programmes, as well as their quality assurance. In Ukraine, the Ministry is interested in outcomes of the project so as to update the legal framework and incorporate its quality assurance standards and mechanisms in the higher education quality assurance national framework. The same state of affairs applies to Kazakhstan and Mongolia where the Ministries of Education are interested in the project's outcomes in order to improve the Cycle 3 programmes delivery and quality assurance.

Afterwards, until the year-end the project will elaborate the quality assurance tools and mechanisms for Cycle 3 programs to be adopted – after being piloted in the second year of project by partner countries relevant authorities.

Overall, the project design fits the Erasmus+ programme identified national and regional priorities as within the project the finalization of suggestions on improvement of regulatory framework of Cycle 3 programmes organization and delivery is foreseen by the end of May and based on this the concrete legal changes will be suggested for adoption for the Ministries in all PCs. Therefore, as part of outcomes, the project is dealing with the organization, delivery and quality assurance of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programs and contribution to the achievement of project objectives in terms of improving the quality assurance and teaching standards, as well as improving the management and operation with the HEIs. The achievement of these two objectives will allow contributing to the enhancement of impact of higher education sector in the societies of relevant PCs at large.

The internal constraints that affected the project's efficient implementation can be deemed as the late receipt of the 1st funding installment by EACEA in February 2017 which for several months postdated the project's effective launch. Nonetheless, the project succeeded in compensating the subsequent minor delays by shifting the workshop foreseen in the 2nd year-start was organized in the end of 2017. As external constraint, the ambiguous situation in Ukraine with regard to the functioning difficulties of the created higher education quality assurance agency can be viewed as one of the affecting factor.

Another external constrain concerns the difficulty of reimbursement of the VAT paid by the Kazakh and Mongolian partner HEIs for the equipment purchased within the project. While, the explanations by the fiscal authorities in Kazakhstan lead to double interpretation, there is not even a framework cooperation agreement with the EU in Mongolia in order to resolve the issue.

EU Education, Cooperation & Development policies

The C3QA project is addressing the following National and Regional Priorities:

- Category B - Improving quality of education and teaching: Bologna process type reforms (cycle system, credit transfer and accumulation, diploma supplement, etc.),
- Category C - Improving management and operation of higher education institutions: internationalization of HEIs and Quality assurance processes and mechanisms.

As for Bologna reforms, it will address quality assurance of cycle 3 programs through establishment and operationalization of internal and external quality assurance mechanisms, national frameworks for QA of cycle 3, pilot of the developed tools. As for internationalization, through benchmarking against the best international trends in offering C3 programs, alignment with Salzburg principles, the project will set a firm platform for internationalization of research through a robust QA system.

Quality of the project implementation

Description of the implemented activities

The activities outlined in the proposal have been running smoothly in line with the proposed activity plan. To align the development of EQA and IQA systems for doctoral programmes in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine with European integration agenda ENQA Standards in Quality Assurance and, most importantly, Salzburg Principles have been taken as the major guidelines. The first half of the project implementation was devoted mainly to building institutional capacities of PC HEIs and QA agencies to develop and operationalize EQA/IQA systems with a wide involvement of the key stakeholders, both internal and external. Conceptualization, formulation and piloting of EQA and IQA policies and procedures for cycle 3 programmes have been effectively launched after capacity building training. Purchase of necessary equipment as well as launch of structural measures has also been successfully completed.

In particular, the project launched with an intensive capacity building under the lead for WP 1, HGERES. The fact-finding on the 4 PC systems was instrumental in better understanding the peculiarities each context brings with their specific trends. To learn from already existing experience in a post-socialist context an inter-project coaching was organized with Tempus VERITAS project, which ensured the lessons learnt from the previous experience are used. Based on the fact-finding results and the lessons learnt, the WG developed a comprehensive training kit for EQA, IQA and Ministries capacity building. With the new training kit, a 3-day training was organized and hosted by KNUTE. 24 academic-teaching, 9 academic-administrative from HEIs and 23 non-academic staff (from EQA and Ministries) were trained to implement EQA and IQA in line with Salzburg principles.

Having built on the capacity of the direct implementers, within the frames of WP2, under the lead of the UAH, an endeavour was made to develop/revise a national policy framework of QA for doctoral programmes. The policy frameworks for the 4 PCs are in the process of development and will be finalized close to the end of year two to allow for the piloting. The WGs launched their activities by conducting a fact-finding of PC national policies, procedures for Cycle 3 in line with Salzburg principles, in-depth analysis of the contexts and specific needs of each partner. Based on the findings 4 national level policies, procedures and structures for Cycle 3 programmes quality assurance will be developed in line with the international developments and European integration agenda. To ensure sharing of experiences and setting a good platform for cross-regional cooperation a workshop was organized at UAH in November 2017. 33 academic and 24 non-academic staff participated in this workshop.

Within the frames of WP3, the actual development of internal and external QA systems has been launched and is still in the process. The lead partners – UCA and UJML3 – have taken respective steps to conduct a second synopsis to better understand QA standards and procedures for Cycle 3 programs currently extant in each HEI. The results fed into a country report for each PC and will be presented during a 2-day workshop on operationalization techniques of IQA and EQA in Lyon in the end of May. The workshop will set a robust platform for hands-on development and first-hand exposure to the EU practice through face-to-face consultancy. After the developments are finalized the policies and procedures will be sent to EU partners for constructive feedback. Further activities will be undertaken to ensure EQA and IQA bodies are established in PCs/ HEIs and efforts will be invested to develop respective policies, criteria and procedures for EQA of Cycle 3 programmes by the end of project 2nd year.

Quality assurance

The project's quality assurance is organized according to the adopted Quality assurance plan (QAP) which is available at the project's website (<http://c3-qa.com/management/>). The QAP includes several measures (mechanisms and processes) combining mid-term and long-term monitoring approaches and tools for quantitative and qualitative information gathering and analysis, such as Minutes of Coordination meetings, reports per Work Packages upon termination, report of monitoring visits, evaluation of the project's events, intermediate fact-funding audit, etc.

In line with the project proposal and QAP, the specific indicators to verify the achievements for the overall project level are as follows:

- 7 reports of work packages,
- 6 minutes of coordination meetings,
- 3 reports on monitoring visits to partner countries institutions,
- Trained staff of Cycle 3 programs providers (27 members), Ministries (12 members) and EQA bodies (9 members) from Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine;
- Updated 4 regulatory frameworks (including standards and procedures) for QA of cycle 3 programs in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine;
- 4 national level guidelines on establishment of QA systems for cycle 3 programs for Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine;
- 4 EQA bodies are established and operational;
- 9 internal quality assurance policy manuals for the PCIs are operational;
- At least one Cycle 3 program in each of 9 participating HEIs are internally and externally evaluated and accredited by partner country EQA bodies,
- 9 equipped units of HEIs and 4 for EQA in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine.

The QAP measures are applied regularly by the project's EMT and when applicable presented to all the partners for external feedback. In this sense, the Minutes of Coordination meetings are approved by the project's Governing board and published at the project's website, 9 units in charge of quality assurance of Cycle 3 (doctoral) studies at partner HEIs are supplied with the required equipment (which is included in the partner institutions' inventory lists), the finalization of the reports per Work Package 1 and 2 are underway, etc.

Some of the indicators of the project's achievements will be presented to the wider range of stakeholders after the ongoing review and feedback by the project's program countries, i.e. UJM, UCA, HCERES, UAH and UJK. This refers to the propositions for the improvement of national regulatory frameworks on organization of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes and national level guidance for the quality assurances of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes. The 1st discussion on the improvement of regulatory framework is foreseen in Mongolia in the beginning of May and upcoming discussions would be held in June in Armenia, Kazakhstan and Ukraine.

For the quality of the Grant management, the project's EMT will use the recommendations and findings of the intermediate audit foreseen in May-June, 2018.

Visibility

The project website (<http://c3-qa.com>) was launched during the Kick-off meeting in February 2017. Through its structure the website is aimed at demonstrating the results, overall implementation of the project, its management and current stage of activities. Within this organization the project website serves as a visibility tool for external stakeholders, also as a management and communication tool with partners since it contains up-to-date information and documentation related to the project coordination and management. Also, on the project website a special section is devoted to the dissemination events organized by the partners locally at their institutions for the visibility of the project, e.g. media coverage by the project partners at their university websites as well as the dissemination through local media sources (accessible here : <http://c3-qa.com/media/>)

Therefore, the Media and News sections of the website contain media articles on the project's Kick-off meeting publicized by online Armenian newspapers. The media coverage and photo illustrations on all the project trainings and workshops organized in Yerevan (Kick-off meeting February 2017), Kyiv (July 2017), Alcalá-de-Henares (November 2017) are also available at project website with high level of accessibility by the visitors according to the website statistics.

In order to promote the project's visibility the stickers mentioning "with the support of the Erasmus+ Programme of the European Union" were distributed among the HEIs receiving equipment for the use of the quality assurance units, doctoral students and publicly available academic spaces.

All materials and presentations produced in the framework of the project contain Erasmus+ and the C3QA project logos.

The implementation of the Quality assurance plan (QAP) combined with the provision of information on project to NEOs in partner countries and EACEA, as well as regular updates of information on C3QA project at Erasmus+ Dissemination Platform, i.e. <http://ec.europa.eu/prm.rammesierasmus-plus/projects/>, will ensure the fulfillment of visibility obligations foreseen by the Grant agreement.

Equipment

According to the need assessment carried out among the project partners and based on the tenders results, the following equipment were acquired for partner countries universities:

- According to the need assessment carried out among the project partners and based on the tenders results, the following equipment were acquired:

- Laptop Fujitsu LIFEBOOK - 46
- Laptop Apple A1466 MacBook Air - 2
- Laptop Asus GL703VM - 1
- Laptop Asus G750 - 1
- Desktop PC Fujitsu ESPRIMO - 61
- Printer/Scanner/Copy Canon iR2520 - 10
- Printer Canon MF411 - 1
- Scanner Canon C130 - 2
- Projector BenQ MX704 - 10
- Projector ACER MR.JMG 11.001 - 1.

The equipment purchased within the project is mainly devoted to the units and staff involved in the quality assurance of Cycle 3 studies in partner countries as well as for project's executive management team. Therefore, acquired equipment is used for the project related activities, such as research, learning, coordination and management by the researcher, managers, technical and administrative staff involved in the project. Moreover, most of the equipment is installed at publically accessible spaces (e.g. library at KAZGUU university, auditoriums, halls and seminar rooms) allowing its wider usage by the students and other academic staff not involved in the project.

According to the will expressed by the partners during the assessment of the need for equipment, it was foreseen to acquire e-literature by the project coordinator or project partners for the usage of all the partner institutions.

As compared to the project proposal, the changes occurred due to the deviant results as expressed in the need assessment of the equipment among partners. Therefore, instead of the software initially foreseen, the partners expressed the will to acquire printer-scanner-copier machines, scanners and projectors.

The expenses not foreseen concern the tender announcement fees for the publication in the official newspaper, as well as expenses on equipment storage in Customs or contracts delivery via DHL postal service.

Other expenses concern the reimbursement of VAT and duties paid by the Mongolian and Kazakh partner HEIs which will be done after the negotiations with fiscal authorities and only upon the approval by the EACEA.

The project includes activities relating to curriculum development

Yes

No

Teaching / Training Activities

Yes

Mobility for Teaching, Training and/or project research activities

The 1st training within the 1st year of the Erasmus+ C3QA project took place between June 4th – 6th, 2017 in Kyiv, Ukraine hosted by the project partner Kyiv National University of Trade and Economics (KNUTE). The training session was aimed at capacity building for staff of partner countries (from higher education institutions, QA agencies and Ministries of education) on organization and external and internal quality assurance of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programs based on the experience of doctoral studies and QA systems adopted by the French, Spanish, and Polish academic contexts.

The 2nd workshop within the 1st working year of the Erasmus+ C3QA project took place between November 16th – 17th, 2017 in Alcalá de Henares, Spain hosted by the project partner University of Alcalá (UAH). The workshop was aimed at developing the Regulatory Frameworks for EQA Cycle 3 (doctoral) Programs based on the fact-finding results identified by the Armenian, Mongolian, Ukrainian, and Kazakh representatives, as well as the Spanish experience on the Standards Fulfilment for the Accreditation of Cycle 3 Programmes. The main discussion topics that were addressed during the workshop touched upon the Salzburg Principles (from 2005 to 2017): EUA Council for Doctoral Education reports (Doctoral Education – Taking Salzburg Forward: Implementation and new challenges (2016)), Standards and guidelines for quality assurance in the European Higher Education Area, Ex-ante accreditation (if required by national regulations), Monitoring (if required by national regulations) and Accreditation.

No

Quality of cooperation

Project management

For the effective project management a 3 level structure of coordination and management was discussed and agreed during the project Kick-off meeting with the following components:

- Project Governing Board – 1 representative from each partner institution to participate in the decision-making of strategic issues related to the project coordination and management,
- National Coordinators – 1 representative from each partner country responsible for coordination at country level,
- Executive Management Team – a body responsible for daily management of the project and in constant communication with contact persons at each partner institution for coordination of project activities.

The lists of members of the project governing board as well as the working groups from each partner institution are accessible via the link here: <http://c3-qa.com/management/>

The management procedure, responsibility and obligations of each partner are clearly mentioned in the partnership agreements which were discussed and validated at the project's Kick –off meeting. Therefore, the finalization of the PAs caused no difficulties. In addition, all copies of the PAs were timely sent to the EACEA.

The management tools used by the project EMT and involved partner institutions are of two types, i.e. for the support of the financial management and project daily activities. UFAR makes use of a specialized accounting software for the project's financial management as well as the financial statement template provided by the EACEA.

For the project's daily activities the tools applied include regular skype discussions, e-mail correspondence, various online document sharing platforms, etc.

The performance indicators used for measuring the achievement of project activities are in line with the project proposal and include the following:

- 7 reports of work packages,
- 6 minutes of coordination meetings,
- 3 reports on monitoring visits to partner countries institutions,
- Trained staff of Cycle 3 programs providers (27 members), Ministries (12 members) and EQA bodies (9 members) from Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine;
- Updated 4 regulatory frameworks (including standards and procedures) for QA of cycle 3 programs in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine;
- 4 national level guidelines on establishment of QA systems for cycle 3 programs for Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine;
- 4 EQA bodies are established and operational;
- 9 internal quality assurance policy manuals for the PCIs are operational;
- At least one Cycle 3 program in each of 9 participating HEIs are internally and externally evaluated and accredited by partner country EQA bodies,
- 9 equipped units of HEIs and 4 for EQA in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine.

Several tools for project internal communication are in place and actively applied, among them:

- Coordination meetings held in Yerevan, Armenia (February 2017), in Kyiv, Ukraine (July 2017), in Alcala-de-Henares, Spain (November 2017), in Lyon, France (foreseen for May 2018), in Astana, Kazakhstan (foreseen September, 2018), in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia (foreseen for June, 2019) and final Coordination meeting in October 2019 (venue, tbc.);
- Monitoring visits held in Kyiv involving the Ukrainian partners (July 2017), in Astana involving the Kazakh partners (November, 2017), foreseen in Ulaanbaatar in May 2018.
- Daily correspondence via project email and working meetings at partner country levels, e.g. local meetings in partner countries involving relevant stakeholders.

Decision-making process aimed at participation of all partners and exercising transparent and collegial approach for reaching common results via mutual consensus.

Involvement of partners and stakeholders

The responsibilities of the involved institutions from both partner and programme countries are in accordance with the project proposal and aimed at project effective implementation and wider inclusion of all partners. In particular, the project partners from the program countries, i.e. HCERES (France), University of Jean Moulin Lyon 3 (France), University of Clermont Auvergne (France), University of Alcala (Spain) and University of Jan Kochanowski in Kielce (Poland) bring their expertise respectively from France, Spain and Poland with regard to the organization and quality assurance of doctoral studies in line with European agenda in the field.

The involved higher education institutions participate in the elaboration of tools and procedures for the internal quality assurance of cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes, as well as in the improvement of the regulatory framework in each partner country.

The involvement of the Ministries has also a particular role for bringing in country specific structural experience on external and internal quality assurance to be further elaborated and applied within the project.

The external quality assurance agencies from partner countries are involved for the overall guidance of the partner HEIs and are in charge of the elaboration and testing of the external mechanisms of quality assurance applied by the respective country HEIs.

In the project consortium there are partner institutions with a lesser experience in Tempus and/or Erasmus+ projects from Mongolia. Therefore the project's EMT takes special care in providing guidance and support throughout the project implementation. In this regard, at the launch of the project, one Mongolian representative was funded by the project budget to participate in the grant managers' conference organized by the EACEA in Brussels in order to receive first-hand experience.

The project's EMT has attached special significance and took into account the special needs of the partner countries in several cases, among them:

- when identifying the partners' need assessment for equipment;
- when organizing the project's 1st training session in Kyiv (instead of Paris) in order to benefit the newly established Ukrainian quality assurance agency which is not part of the project consortium,
- when translating the Training kit into Russian (along with Kazakh) as one of the official languages in Kazakhstan taking into account the need for wider dissemination,
- when providing special support to the Kazakh and Mongolian partners to reimburse their VAT expenses for the acquired equipment, etc.

In line with the project's special objectives, the project contributed to the internal cooperation between the universities leading to the signature of bilateral agreements between several partner institutions of the project, such as between UFAR and KAZGUU, KNUTE and UAH, KAZGUU and UAH, etc.

Management of the grant

Within the project EMT both the project coordinator and the financial director of the grant-holding institution are collaborating closely and are assisted by the administrative and technical support of the employee specially paid by the UFAR for these purposes.

The grant management procedure fits with the overall project management structures and methodology and special effort was made to familiarize all the project partners with the EACEA guidelines for the grant users from the very beginning of the project. Thus, during the Kick-off meeting all the requirements of the grant management were outlined by the EMT and discussed by all the partners. Moreover, during the next 2 Coordination meetings the work on grant management issues were performed without neglecting the daily support provided by the EMT to equip all the partners with tailored answers to their inquiries.

Within the consortium a performance-based approach is applied and a common methodology for each category of costs is agreed. For instance, for the equipment purchase it was decided, upon possibility, to make a centralized tender for the supply of all the countries in order to simplify the tender procedure; for staff costs it was decided to use no less than 50 percent of the costs for the researcher category, and the rest for the other categories, etc.

Upon the suggestion of the EMT, the project's governing board approved the suggestion to carry out an intermediate audit on the project's factual findings which will contribute to the effective management of the grant using the identified recommendations for further improvement.

The main concern during the grant management related to the purchase of the video conference set needed by the project partner KNUTE, since after the 1st tender no fitting offers were received and the 2nd tender was announced.

The Erasmus+ related documents were made available from the beginning of the project at the project's website accessible via the link here: <http://c3-qa.com/erasmus-program-documents/>

The project coordinator of the grant management regularly informs the partners on each category of costs as well as overall expenses of the grant at each Coordination meeting.

IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY

Awareness raising, dissemination, sustainability and exploitation of the project results

To ensure wider impact and visibility of the project activities and outcomes, concrete measures are taken and envisaged in line with the project (updated) Work plan:
- Communication on project Kick-off meeting in Yerevan, capacity building training in Kiev and workshop in Alcalá de Henares through media and C3QA project/partners' webpages:

<http://www.tert.am/am/news/2017/02/03/erasmus/2267761>

<https://www.armenpress.am/arm/multimedia/slideshows/58336/>

<http://www.mecss.gov.mn/post/17020701>

<http://www.aravot.am/2017/02/03/852153/>

<http://www.panarmenian.net/arm/photoset/10374/102970>

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YNKHL1fW1eU>

<http://www.ambafrance-am.org/Ceremonie-de-lancement-d-un-programme-Erasmus-a-l-Universite-francaise-en>

<http://www.slaq.am/arm/news/1156147/>

<https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read/?pid=22476&en>

<http://kazguu.kz/en/mezhdunarodnoye-sotrudnichestvo/erasmus-drugie-proektyi/>

<https://www.knteu.kiev.ua/blog/read/?pid=22477&en>

<http://accmon.mn/c3qa-%D1%82%D3%A9%D1%81%D3%A9%D0%BB/>

<http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/articles/profile/2462>

<http://www.hneu.edu.ua/web/articles/profile/2601>

<https://www.facebook.com/100009955218078/videos/609147692760399/?id=100009955218078>

<http://www.anqa.am/en/internationalization/>

<http://c3qa.iqaa.kz/en/news/item/2028-predstaviteli-iqaa-prinyali-uchastie-v-obuchayushchem-seminare-vneshnyaya-i-vnutrennyaya-otsenka-obrazovatelykh-programm-doktorantury-po-proektu-erasmus-v-gorode-kiev-ukraina-4-6-iyulya-2017-g>

<http://c3qa.iqaa.kz/en/news/item/2030-provedenie-vneshnego-monitoringa-po-proektu-erasmus-c3qa>

<http://blogs.ukgu.kz/en/content/c3qa-%C2%ABpromoting-internationalization-research-through-creation-quality-assurance-system-3rd->

<http://www.yafa.am/?cat=193>

- Discussions/presentation of project activities and intermediate results with the country internal and external stakeholders,
- Development and dissemination of newsletters in English and national languages,
- Publication of brochures on project activities in English and national languages,
- Dissemination via national media,
- Organization of national round tables to discuss the project outcomes with the stakeholders,
- Organization of dissemination conferences in partner countries, etc.

The involvement of ministries of education and national agencies for higher education quality assurance from Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine and their willingness to contribute and use the project outcomes is the best guarantee for sustainability of project outcomes. Therefore, the adoption of concrete suggestions on legal framework improvement and quality assurance tools and mechanism is envisaged by partners countries relevant authorities.

Project realised deliverables are so far:

- Capacity building for 57 participants for training and workshop including academic teaching, academic administrative and non-academic staff from participating higher education institutions, ministries of education and national agencies for higher education quality assurance from Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine,
 - Fact-funding country reports on Quality Assurance of Cycle 3 (doctoral) programmes in Higher Education in Armenia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Ukraine, available in English at: <http://c3-qa.com/project-documents/>. The translation of the reports into Armenia, Kazakh, Russian, Mongolian and Ukrainian languages is under finalization.
 - Training kit on organization and quality assurance of doctoral studies in Spain, France and Poland.
- The only change compared to the dissemination and sustainability activities envisaged in the application concerns the translation of Training kit into Russian as official language too, done per the request of Kazakh partners.

Statistics and Indicators

Type of equipment:

- books and pedagogic material
- audio-visual equipment
- Computers and software
- lab material
- Other

For Curriculum Development projects

- Yes

Level of new/updated courses:

- Short cycle
- 1st Cycle (e.g. Bachelor)
- 2nd Cycle (e.g. Master)
- 3rd Cycle (e.g. Doctoral)
- Vocational Education and Training

Type of recognition:

- HEI Degree
- National degree
- Multiple Degree
- Joint Degree

Volume (in ECTS) of new/updated courses

The new study programme includes:

- Placements/internships for students

Career orientation service

Career development measures

Number of learners / trainees enrolled (per intake / course delivery)

Type of skills/competence developed:

- Transversal/behavioural skills
- Technical /academic /scientific / research skills
- Linguistic competences

% of the new curriculum taught in foreign language of the the total of new curriculum developed by the project

For Training/Mobility Activities

Number of partner country "HEIs' students" trained

Number of partner country "HEIs' academic staff" trained

Number of partner country "HEIs' administrative staff" trained

Number of partner country "non-HEI individuals" trained (priv. sector, NGOs, civil servants, etc.)

IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY

Impact at individual level

Extent of attention given to vulnerable groups

to a very small extent

Number of direct beneficiaries in the Partner country(ies) per year: academic staff from HEIs

0

Number of direct beneficiaries in the PCs (/year): administrative staff from HEIs

0

Number of direct beneficiaries in the PCs (/year): HE students

0

Number of direct beneficiaries in

1

the PCs (/year): non HE individuals

Impact at institutional level

Extent of impact at institutional level: for instance new courses / strategies (policies, regulations) / services (units, centres)

totally accomplished

Potential of planned project measures to contribute to new national cooperation activities in the Partner countries HEIs as a result of the project (Memorandum of Understanding /research projects / joint publications /participation in networks or associations etc.)

totally accomplished

Potential of project to contribute to new international cooperation activities in the Partner countries HEIs as a result of the project (international agreements / Memorandum of Understanding / research projects / joint publications / participation in networks or associations, etc.)

totally accomplished

Impact on the HE Sector

Potential of project to contribute to new (/updated) national or regional policies / laws / regulations in HE

totally accomplished

Potential of project to contribute to the establishment (/ further development) of external bodies (/associations /agencies)

totally accomplished

Potential of project to contribute to improve the excellence / competitiveness / attractiveness of the Higher Education institutions

totally accomplished

Innovative character of the planned results (i.e. the courses developed; the new tools, services, procedures delivered; the strategies implemented for reaching the target groups; etc.)

totally accomplished

Impact on the society as a whole

Potential of the project to pay particular attention to least developed countries

not applicable

Potential of the project to engage Partner Countries HEIs in new means of cooperation with employers and other stakeholders

totally accomplished

(e.g. NGOs, associations, etc.)

Measures contributing to improving lifelong learning approaches in the Partner Country HEIs

not applicable

Sustainability

Institutional support for Partner Country HEIs to sustain project results

totally accomplished

Measures to collect Sources of financial (/logistic) support for sustaining the project results from:

- Partner HEIs
- Public authorities in Partner countries
- NGOs
- Private sector
- European Union
- Other

QUALITY OF PARTNERSHIP & COOPERATION

Involvement of students in the project implementation

to a very small extent

Involvement of non-educational stakeholders in the project implementation

to a small extent

RELEVANCE in relation to project objectives

To what extent the project contributes to the policy objectives of the Partner Countries

to a very high extent

Project potential to promote EU's horizontal policies

- Agriculture, fisheries and foods
- Business
- Climate action
-

Cross-cutting policies

- Culture, education and youth
- Economy, finance and tax
- Employment and social rights
- Energy and natural resources
- Environment, consumers and health
- External relations and foreign affairs
- Justice, home affairs and citizens' rights
- Regions and local development
- Science and technology
- Transport and travel

Meetings, Training and Mobilities

Meetings, Trainings and Mobilities

Estimated dates of consortium meetings until the end of the projects

Venue country	Venue city	Date of Meeting
Armenia	Yerevan	03/02/2016
Ukraine	Kiev	06/07/2017
España	Alcalá de Henares	17/11/2017
France	Lyon	31/05/2018
Kazakhstan	Astana	21/09/2018
Mongolia	Ulaanbaatar	14/06/2019
Armenia	Yerevan	18/10/2019

Training and Mobilities

Event	Purpose	Type of participants	Gender	Number	Country of Origin	Country of destination	Duration (in weeks)	%compared to objectives
1	Other	Academic staff – teaching	Number Male	11	-	Armenia	1	100
1	Other	Academic staff – teaching	Number Female	9	-	Armenia	1	100

1	Other	Academic staff – administrative	Number Male	1	-	Armenia	1	100
1	Other	Academic staff – administrative	Number Female	6	-	Armenia	1	100
1	Other	Non-academic staff	Number Male	7	-	Armenia	1	100
1	Other	Non-academic staff	Number Female	9	-	Armenia	1	100
2	Training	Academic staff – teaching	Number Male	11	-	Armenia	1	100
2	Training	Academic staff – teaching	Number Female	13	-	Armenia	1	100
2				1			1	100
2				8			1	100
2				8			1	100
2				15			1	100
3				13			1	100
3				13			1	100
3				0			1	100
3				7			1	100
3				10			1	100
3				14			1	100

Attachments

Type of File	Name of the File
Budget Table	C3QA 574273 project financial_statements-final.xlsm
Declaration of Honour	Declaration of honour C3QA 574273 project.pdf
Table of achieved results	Annex C table_of_achieved_planned_results 574273 C3QA project.pdf
Dissemination/Exploitation Plan	Communication strategy c3qa project.pdf
Quality Assurance Plan	Quality assurance plan c3qa project.pdf
Report Special Mobility Strand	
Request for Payment	Statement of costs incurred C3QA 574273 project.pdf